### Post MDGs: Issues for the Future

12<sup>th</sup> January 2012





## Outline

- Performance Appraisal Pakistan
- Issues for Future
- Structural Weaknesses
- Political Economy Context
- Recommendations

















# Pakistan's Status at a Glance

| Status    | Number | Indicators  |
|-----------|--------|---|
| Ahead     | 6      | <ul> <li>Proportion of seats held by women in National Parliament</li> <li>Proportion of children under five who suffered from diarrhoea in the last 30 days and received ORT</li> <li>HIV prevalence among 15-24 year old pregnant women (%)</li> <li>HIV prevalence among vulnerable group (e.g., active sexual workers) (%)</li> <li>Proportion of TB cases detected and cured under DOTS (Direct Observed Treatment Short Course)</li> <li>No. of vehicles using CNG</li> </ul> |
| On track  | 2      | •Lady Health Workers' coverage of target population •Land area protected for the conservation of wildlife   |
| Slow      | 4      | <ul> <li>Share of women in wage employment in the non-agricultural sector</li> <li>Gender Parity Index (GPI) for primary&amp; secondary education</li> <li>Youth Literacy GPI</li> <li>GDP (at constant factor cost) per unit of energy use as a proxy for energy efficiency</li> </ul>   |
| Lag       | 20     |   |
| Off track | 1      | •Infant mortality   |

## Goal 1: Eradicating Extreme Poverty and Hunger

| Indicators   | 1990-91 | 2001-02 | 2005-06 | 2008- 09 | MDG<br>Targets<br>2015 | Status |
|--|---------|---------|---------|----------|------------------------|--------|
| Proportion of population below the calorie based food plus nonfood poverty line. | 26.1    | 34.5    | 22.3    | n/a      | 13                     | Lag    |
| Prevalence of underweight children under 5 years of age                          | 40      | 41.5    | 38      | 38       | < 20                   | Lag    |
| Proportion of population below minimum level of dietary energy consumption       | 25      | 30      | n/a     | n/a      | 13                     | Lag    |

### Goal 2: Achieving Universal Primary Education

| Indicators                      | 1990-91 | 2001-02 | 2008- 09 | MDG<br>Targets<br>2015 | Status |
|---------------------------------|---------|---------|----------|------------------------|--------|
| Net primary enrolment ratio (%) | 46      | 42      | 57       | 100                    | Lag    |
| Completion/survival rate        | 50      | 57.3    | 54.6     | 100                    | Lag    |
| Male                            |         | 53.3    | 54.8     |                        |        |
| Female                          |         | 64.3    | 54.6     |                        |        |
| Literacy Rate%                  | 35      | 45      | 57       | 88                     | Lag    |
| Male                            | 48      | 55      | 69       |                        |        |
| Female                          | 21      | 35      | 45       |                        |        |

### GOAL 3: Promoting Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment

| Indicators   | 1990-91                 | 2001-02      | 2004-05       | 2008- 09        | MDG<br>Targets<br>2015 | Status |
|--|-------------------------|--------------|---------------|-----------------|------------------------|--------|
| Gender parity index (GPI) Primary Secondary                      | 0.73<br>n/a             | 0.82<br>0.75 | 0.85<br>0.83  | 0.84<br>0.8     | 1.00<br>0.94           | Slow   |
| Youth literacy GPI   | 0.51                    | 0.64         | 0.68          | 0.78            | 1.00                   | Slow   |
| Share of women in wage employment in the non-agricultural sector | 8.07                    | 9.65         | 10.11         | 10.64           | 14                     | Slow   |
| Proportion of seats held by women in the                         |                         |              |               |                 |                        |        |
| National Assembly  | 2/217<br>0.9%           | *            | 73/342<br>21% | 76/342<br>22.2% |                        | Ahead  |
| Senate   |                         |              | . = 1         | . = 4           |                        |        |
|  | 1/87<br>1% <sup>3</sup> |              | 17/100<br>17% | 17/100<br>17%   |                        |        |

## Goal 4: Reducing Child Mortality

| Indicators  | 1990-91 | 2001-02 | 2006-07 | 2008- 09 | MDG<br>Targets<br>2015 | Status    |
|---|---------|---------|---------|----------|------------------------|-----------|
| Under-five mortality rate   | 117     |         | 94      |          | 52                     | Lag       |
| Infant mortality rate   | 102     | 77      | 75      |          | 40                     | Off Track |
| Proportion of children under five who suffered from diarrhoea in the last 30 days | 26      | 12      | 11      | 10       | <10                    | Lag       |
| Lady Health Workers' coverage of target population                                | n/a     | 38      | 76      | 83       | 100                    | Lag       |
| Proportion of fully immunised children 12-23 months                               | 75      | 53      | 76      | 78       | >90                    | Ahead     |
| Proportion of under 1 year children immunised against measles                     | 80      | 57      | 77      | 79       | >90                    | On track  |

## Goal 5: Improve Maternal Health

| Indicators  | 1990-91 | 2001-02 | 2006-07 | 2008- 09 | MDG<br>Targets<br>2015 | Status |
|---|---------|---------|---------|----------|------------------------|--------|
| Maternal mortality ratio  | 533     | 350     | 276     |          | 140                    | Lag    |
| Proportion of births attended by skilled birth attendants   | 18      | 40      | 37      | 41       | >90                    | Lag    |
| Contraceptive prevalence rate   | 12      | 28      | 29.6    | 30.8     | 55                     | Lag    |
| Total fertility rate  | 5.4     |         | 4.1     | 3.75     | 2.1                    | Lag    |
| Proportion of women 15-49 years who had given birth during last 3 years and made at least one antenatal care consultation | 15      | 35      | 53      | 58       | 100                    | Lag    |

### Goal 6: Combating HIV/AIDS, Malaria and Other Diseases

| Indicators   | 1990-91 | 2001-02 | 2008- 09                                    | MDG Targets<br>2015                 | Status |
|--|---------|---------|---|-------------------------------------|--------|
| HIV prevalence among 15-24 year old pregnant Women (%)   | n/a     | n/a     | <0.1  | Baseline to be<br>reduced<br>by 50% | Ahead  |
| * (e.g., active sexual workers) (%)  | n/a     | n/a     | IDU= 20.8<br>FSW= n/a<br>MSW=0.9<br>HSW=6.4 | Baseline to be reduced by 50%       | Ahead  |
| Proportion of population in malaria risk areas using effective malaria prevention and treatment measures | n/a     | 20      | 30  | 75                                  | Lag    |
| Incidence of tuberculosis per 100,000 population   | 171     | 181     | 181   | 45                                  | Lag    |
| Proportion of TB cases detected and cured under DOTS (Direct Observed Treatment Short Course)            | n/a     | 79      | 85  | 85                                  | Ahead  |

## Goal 7: Ensuring Environment Sustainability

| Indicators  | 1990-91 | 2001-02 | 2008- 09 | MDG<br>Targets<br>2015 | Status   |
|---|---------|---------|----------|------------------------|----------|
| Forest cover including state owned and private forest and farmlands                               | 4.8     | 4.8     | 5.02     | 6.0                    | Lag      |
| Land area protected for the conservation of wildlife  | 9.1     | 11.25   | 11.5     | 12.0                   | On Track |
| GDP (at constant factor cost) per unit of energy use as a proxy for energy efficiency             | 26,471  | 27,047  | 26,543   | 28,000                 | Slow     |
| No. of vehicles using CNG (000)   | -       | 330     | 2,200    | 920                    | Ahead    |
| Sulphur content in high speed diesel (as a proxy for ambient air quality)                         | 1.0     | 1.0     | 1.0      | 0.5 - 0.25             | Lag      |
| Proportion of population(urban and rural) with sustainable access to a safe improved water source | 53      | 64      | 65       | 93                     | Lag      |
| Proportion of population(urban and rural) with access to sanitation                               | 30      | 45      | 63       | 90                     | Lag      |

### Goal 8: Developing a Global Partnership for Development

- Traditional aid dependence has been reduced to a large extent
- Poor budgetary management however forces resort to IMF
- Trade-related partnerships are being fostered
- Growing foreign investment interests in key infrastructure sectors



### 1. Macro-Micro Disconnect

- Something is alarmingly wrong!
  - Improving education and health numbers ..... But declining long run growth
  - Greater investment commitments but declining absorption in education and health
    - Public Sector Development Program

### 2. How is Inequality Viewed?

- Inequality [e.g. Incomes, Consumptions, Opportunities]
  - Rural Setting-I: Rising per capita but lack of access to basic services
  - Rural Setting-II: lacking capacity to organize
  - Rural Setting-III Income growth not translating into empowerment
- Inequality [e.g. access and quality of infrastructure]
  - Urban Setting-I: Fragmented zoning leading to malfunction
  - Urban Setting-II: Domestic commerce being stifled
  - Urban Setting-III: High rates of internal migration

### 3. Who will implement reforms?

- Capacity Building (but without civil service reforms)
- Civil Service Reforms (but without accountability)
- Still not getting the mix right:
  - 1970s → Government will do it (Nationalization)
  - 1980s → Private Sector will do it (Privatization)
  - $-1990s \rightarrow NGOs$  will do it
  - 2000s → Bill Gates will do it! (Private Philanthropy)

## MDGs & Political Economy Context - Pakistan

- Pakistan faces numerous challenges in meeting the MDGs due to:
  - Regional imbalance in growth and welfare
  - Climate Change-led natural disasters
  - Militancy and increase in expenditure on war on terror
  - Volatile global prices
  - Election year 2013 and beyond
- Efforts towards the achievement of the MDGs:
  - Devolution, though 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment
  - Social Protection Schemes e.g. BISP, Provincial programs
  - Commitments from the global community

## Learning from Past Experience of MDGs

- Uncoordinated implementation resulting in low impact
- Lack of capacity at local levels in terms of human and financial resources affecting service delivery
- There is growing evidence of widening disparities in social indicators, implying that most progress has by-passed the segments of society that need the most support
- Volatile commodity prices threatening to undermine the recent progress observed in reducing poverty
- The growing deficits in public accounts are constraining the available fiscal space for pro-poor public spending targeting the attainment of MDGs

## Issues getting diluted!

- Short term → Food insecurity and malnutrition
- Medium term → Youth bulge and lack of strategy for youth engagement
- Long term → Climate Change and related health hazards

### Some Recommendations

#### Focus on:

- local level administrative reforms first
- Putting in place accountability measures at all tiers
- Taking stock of required sectoral investment
- Executing investment through (community-based arrangements and public-private modes)

#### • Triggers should be:

- Social Capital (bridging trust deficits between public sector and community)
- Social Accountability (demand-side capacity of communities to demand better services)
- Social Innovations (pro-poor and informal sector innovations have greater diffusion)

# Thank You

www.sdpi.org, www.sdpi.tv
vaqar@sdpi.org